Emergency Relief Logistics: Military and NGO Crisis Response

Dr Anthony Beresford
(Dr Stephen Pettit)

Cardiff Business School

Bangkok, July 2006

Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport Seedcorn Research Project
Context

Natural Hazards / Disasters
(Earthquakes, Floods etc.)

Managing Change

Law and Policy
(NGOs, Govts, UN etc)

Humanitarian Aid / Emergency Relief

Migration
(War, Politics, Oppression etc.)

Famine

Medical

Poverty
(Health, Hunger etc.)

War / Conflict

Population
(Resouce depletion, sanitation etc.)

Facets of Humanitarian Aid / Emergency Relief
Introduction

Aims

• To consider the relationship between military organisations and NGOs in the provision of emergency relief
• To identify and review existing models of emergency relief response
• To clarify the relationships between existing models
• To develop a new emergency response model
Research Background

- Jennings, Beresford, Banomyong (2000) – Initial work on disaster response model
- ILT seedcorn funded project (2003/4) to consider range of emergency relief response models (Military/NGO/Other)
Issues

Emergency relief response is a complex mix of military and NGO activity

- Is the situation a military or natural event?
- Are military resources to be used?
- Can NGOs operate without military support?
- Will the military have to provide relief supplies which they do not consider to be part of their remit (e.g. Um Qasr, Iraq – UK forces)?
- Will military involvement affect the neutrality of the NGOs (e.g. Afghanistan – MSF)?
Who are the actors in relief situations?

- Every situation has a different complex of military and non-military actors.
- The aims and objectives of military and non-military actors are not the same.
- Coordination between the actors is required in order to both sustain the relief effort and to provide ‘neutral’ aid.
Emergency Relief Actors

UN Organisations
- UNHCR
- WFP
- UNJLC
- World Bank
- Other UN Agencies

International Committee of the Red Cross

CARE
World Vision
Medecins Sans Frontieres
Save the Children
Oxfam
Other NGOs

Donor Countries

UK Military
Other Military

Host Country

Relief Aid

Humanitarian Assistance

Regional Organisations
- Other Regional Organisations
- European Union

Source: adapted from Fritz Institute (2000)
Example - Sierra Leone

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>• Host Country</th>
<th>• Donor Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>– Government of Sierra Leone</td>
<td>– UK FCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– Sierra Leone Police Force</td>
<td>– UK DfID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– National Committee on Food Aid</td>
<td>– UK FCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– National Committee for Repatriation…</td>
<td>– USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– National Committee on Demobilisation…</td>
<td>– Nigeria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– RUF Political</td>
<td>– China</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– RUF Military</td>
<td>– Liberia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– CDF Military</td>
<td>– Guinea</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– CDF Political</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>• UN Organisations</th>
<th>• Regional Organisations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>– UN Mission to Sierra Leone (UNAMSIL)</td>
<td>– African Union (AU)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– UNHCR</td>
<td>– Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– International Special Court for Sierra Leone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>– UN Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (OCHA)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Example - Sierra Leone

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NGOs</th>
<th>UK Military</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Merlin</td>
<td>- International Military Advisory and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Training Team (IMATT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- OXFAM</td>
<td>- Other Military</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- CARE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- MSF</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- AFRICARE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| International Committee of the Red Cross (ICRC) |

Source: adapted from JDCC (2004)
Approaches

• Business Logistics models don’t transfer easily to Humanitarian Aid Logistics (Oloruntoba and Gray, 2002) due to complexity of relief logistics responses and relationships between actors

• Little agreement on the detail of relationships between NGOs and between NGOs and military (Stock, 1990; Long and Wood, 1995; Whalley, 2003; Fritz Institute, 2004)

• Focus on response rather than preparedness

• Key to effective response: coordination
Approaches

• Examples:
  – Ryongchon, North Korea – Train Explosion
    • Issues: Political dogma; Sub-optimal routeing; slower, more costly distribution
  – Darfur, Western Sudan – complex emergency
    • Issues: Remoteness; Insecurity; Fragile air-road supply line
  – Kashmir, Pakistan - earthquake
    • Issues: Remoteness; Insecurity; Cumbersome supply line – air, truck, donkey
  – New Orleans, USA – hurricane and floods
    • Issues: Organisational structure, severe physical infrastructure damage, political dimension
Humanitarian Aid and Military Relief Logistics

- Individual country response mechanisms are often overwhelmed by scale of crisis or by political problems
- UN standard mechanism for international involvement
  - National response
  - UN Response
  - NGO Response
  - Donors
- Situation complicated as balance has to be achieved between military and humanitarian requirements
British defence doctrine distinguishes between disaster relief and HA provision

Military ideally do not want to be involved in HA provision – a secondary activity from which will exit a.s.a.p

Humanitarian operations accompany /support civilian organisations
  – Humanitarian/Disaster Relief Operations
  – Humanitarian Assistance
Humanitarian Aid and Military Relief Logistics

• Level and form of coordination between the military and relief agencies affected by a number of issues:
  – UN Charter requires agencies to work with host government
  – UN relatively slow in response
  – UN long term commitment
  – NGOs less bureaucratic
  – NGOs decentralised compared to centralised military
  – NGO intervention may not be as carefully planned
  – Neutrality is important issue
Humanitarian Aid and Military Relief Logistics

- Initial response in a crisis situation may rely on military capability
- Provides alternative supply chain
- Military response has to interface with non-military organisations
- Military models do not necessarily consider the link between its fighting role and HA provision
Inter-State Conflict Model

Source: adapted from JDCC (2004)
Alternative Conflict Model

Source: adapted from JDCC (2004)
Planning Peace Support

Source: adapted from JDCC (2004)
Humanitarian and Health

Activity

HUMANITARIAN ASSISTANCE

Relief Aid

Donor Country

Host Country

UN Organisations

International Committee of the Red Cross

Regional Organisations

NGOs

Remove immediate effects of conflict

Planning Peace Support

Interim Conditions

Steady State Conditions

Donor Country

UK Military

Other Military

Source: adapted from JDCC (2004)
Impartiality

• Important dimension in military / NGO interplay
• NGOs *per se* are neutral
• Military involvement can be perceived as skewed
• Military have to invest considerable effort in ensuring impartiality
• Military stance will vary depending on situation on ground
Humanitarian Aid Logistics

• Disaster Management Cycle
  – Preparation
  – Response
  – Recovery

• Can be sub-split into 8 stages as suggested:
Preparedness

Assessment/Appeals

Resource Mobilisation

Procurement

Transportation/Execution

Tracking and Tracing

Stock/Asset Management

Performance Evaluation

Preparation

Response

Recovery

Source: adapted from Fritz Institute (2000)
Preparedness

Is the environment under military control?
  Yes → Will military permission be required to operate?
    Yes → Seek necessary permission
    No → Establish location and number of refugees
  No → Consider use of military resources
    Yes → Are military resources available?
    No → Permission granted
    Yes → Permit issued
Resource Mobilisation

Assessment / Appeals
- No
  - No
    - Permission granted
      - Assess Financial/Practical Requirements
        - Ran Appeals Process
          - Yes
  - Yes

Resource Mobilisation
- Mobilise Resources
  - Yes
  - No
    - Is host country landlocked?
      - Yes
      - No
        - Is the crisis ongoing?
          - Yes
          - No
Conclusions

• No single model can accommodate all variables
• Key dimensions where military are involved:
  – Is it a conflict situation?
  – Is it a natural disaster?
• Military conflict situation will be shaped by security considerations
• Balance required between military and NGO logistics effort
  – Military early stages
  – NGO HA effort gradually taking over
Conclusions

- Balance between country's indigenous HA capability and external aid
- Speed and scale may influence who is initially involved
- Model based on NGOs system with military linked in at appropriate points
- Variables which must be addressed:
  - balance between military and NGO effort
  - dynamics of individual supply chain and can it be streamlined
Future Research

• Current model is based on desk research
• Work required to test cases against models
• Key Logistics Issues:
  – Balance of military / non-military logistics
  – Structure and finance of supply chain
  – Indigenous vs External Capability
  – Speed of achieving stability determines:
    • Length and form of response
    • Level of NGO involvement
  – Geopolitical circumstances
    • border issues and internal security
    • international relations